

1968

Use of the simultaneous cross-relation by sixteenth century English and continental composers

Tim Montgomery

Follow this and additional works at: <https://scholarship.richmond.edu/honors-theses>

 Part of the [Musicology Commons](#)

Recommended Citation

Montgomery, Tim, "Use of the simultaneous cross-relation by sixteenth century English and continental composers" (1968). *Honors Theses*. 1033.

<https://scholarship.richmond.edu/honors-theses/1033>

This Thesis is brought to you for free and open access by the Student Research at UR Scholarship Repository. It has been accepted for inclusion in Honors Theses by an authorized administrator of UR Scholarship Repository. For more information, please contact scholarshiprepository@richmond.edu.



USE OF THE SIMULTANEOUS CROSS-RELATION
BY SIXTEENTH CENTURY ENGLISH
AND CONTINENTAL COMPOSERS

Tim Montgomery
Music H 391

MUSIC LIBRARY
UNIVERSITY OF RICHMOND

LIBRARY
UNIVERSITY OF RICHMOND
VIRGINIA 23173

The principle of the simultaneous cross-relation in vocal music has generally and commonly been associated with the English composers of the sixteenth century. (M p.71; R 824 n.34) This assumption has been more specifically connected with secular music, namely the English madrigal. (Dy p.13) To find the validity of this assumption in relation to both secular and sacred music I have compared the available vocal music of three English composers, two major and one minor: Thomas Tallis (1505-1585), William Byrd (1543-1623), and Thomas Whythorne (1528-1596). In deciding whether the simultaneous cross-relation was an aspect of English music exclusively, I examined vocal music of three composers of the continent, contemporaries of the English, for the use, if any, of the simultaneous cross-relation. Giovanni Palestrina (1525-1594), Orlando di Lasso (c. 1532-1594), and Carlo Gesualdo (c. 1560-1613).

The conclusions I have reached are based on observations of available music which will serve as a representation for comparative analysis of this principle.

Cross-relations are of two types: 1. An occurrence of a chromatic contradiction between two notes of the same triad. This is the type with which this paper shall be chiefly concerned: the simultaneous cross-relation. 2. The cross-relation may result from a chromatic contradiction of similar character in two adjacent chords. (Dy p. 13)

In the music of Palestrina, Lasso, and Gesualdo I found

not a single instance of simultaneous cross-relation. This is in itself noteworthy in comparison to the music of the English in which there were a comparatively large number. Even more noteworthy is the fact that Gesualdo, in his madrigals, carefully avoids the harsh effect of the cross-relation. This is remarkable in one best known as a harmonic experimenter.(R p. 430f.)

Thus, having found no cross-relations in music by the sixteenth century continental composers, and many in music by the English, the general assertion is justified, that the frequent use of the simultaneous cross-relation is characteristic only of sixteenth century English composers.

Of the thirteen motets by Thomas Tallis that I examined, five contained at least one simultaneous cross-relation. This same frequency of usage was found in the music of William Byrd. Of 157 works examined, there were twenty-four instances of the simultaneous cross-relation. These two resemble each other strikingly in that the cross-relation occurs at a definite cadence point of the voices involved as opposed to the continuing vocal line of the other voice involved. This resemblance may be accounted for by the fact that Byrd was a pupil of Tallis and also at one time a business partner(R p. 784f.), but whether the influence of the teacher Tallis upon the pupil Byrd explains the frequency of the same phenomenon in Byrd's music, or whether it is a national trait, is still speculative.

A good example of Tallis' use of the technique appears in "Salvator Mundi"(pr. in Gr p.106), where in measure 12 the

soprano line cadences on G, as does the tenor, three beats later. The cross-relation occurs between these voices and the first and second alto respectively. In both instances the alto voice has just entered as the soprano and tenor lines are cadencing.

The image shows a handwritten musical score for four voices: Soprano (Sop.), Alto I (A I), Alto II (A II), and Tenor/Bass (T B). The score is for measure 12, indicated by a handwritten 'm. 12.' above the Soprano staff. The Soprano line ends on a G note. The Tenor/Bass line also ends on a G note, three beats later than the Soprano. The Alto I and Alto II lines enter in this measure, with notes that create a cross-relation with the G notes of the Soprano and Tenor/Bass lines. The notation includes clefs, a key signature of one flat, and various note values and rests.

In each instance of the cross-relation in Tallis the principle is the same: purposeful structuring of the lines to bring about a contradiction or colorful clash between two lines. Other examples of the identical principle occur in Tallis' "Lamentations"(B part I,m.5), and in "In ieiunio et fletu"(ms. ed. J.Kerman, m.48).

Similarly structured, but more audibly exposed, are two other examples: in the final measures of both the Agnus Dei from a Mass for Four Voices (pr.in Gr p.102), and a four-voiced Nunc Dimittis (CA p.15 mm.33 and 34), a poignant final cadence is achieved by the cross-relation between the top voice and an inner one.

Of particular interest is a simultaneous reoss-relation in part II of Tallis' "Lamentations" (ed.Buck mm.60 and 61).

It is the only instance in the Tallis works examined in which this technique is used for text illustration. A cross-relation occurs twice on the word "angustias" (misery or fear). The structure of the contradicting lines is the same purposeful technique as in the other instances, but used to a more purposeful effect of word painting.

The structuring of line I have referred to is clearly defined by R. O. Morris:

"Where a melody rises or falls by a tone, and then falls or rises by the same interval, the tendency is to reduce the tone to a semitone by chromatic alteration when possible."(M p.12)

This accounts for inflection of individual lines, but the combining of the inflection with a clashing uninflected tone he points out as a technical feature intrinsically English:

"There was a general tendency on the part of singers at this period, in scale passages, to sharpen the seventh going up and to flatten it coming down, so that fairly close juxtapositions of B \flat and B \natural , C \flat and C \sharp , and so on, would inevitably occur quite often, whether specifically intended by the composer or not. But the Englishmen went much further than the foreign composers, for they positively went out of their way to bring about these single clashes in a single chord."(M p.71)

This observation explains the principle I have found to be consistently operative in Tallis, Byrd, and Whythorne.

In a majority of instances of the cross-relation, the seventh degree of a given key in a section of a piece is inflected according to the rule of musica ficta stated by Morris.

In Byrd's motets in Cantiones Sacrae (1575), the same principle of structure occurs. But Byrd employs the simultaneous

cross-relation more frequently than his teacher Tallis. However, Byrd does, in this more frequent usage, involve the cross-relation in more exposed places and to more varied effect. The most striking example I have found occurs in his setting, "Be unto me O Lord a Tower" (WB m.34). Here the cross-relation occurs on the third degree of G major, the key of the prededing measures. The soprano sings a B^b against Bⁿ in the tenor, descending to A, the third degree of the following F major section. I have not observed a comparable usage in either Tallis or Whythorne, but find it typical of Byrd's individuality in expanding a principle already established as a national trait.

Whythorne, in "Grace after Meate" (Wh m.17), like Tallis and Byrd, uses the cross-relation in defining a cadence point of all voices.

m. 17.

by an- y ways
by an- y ways
a- ny ways
by an- y ways

Of similar structure is a second instance of a cross-relation in "Behold now praise the Lord" (Wh m.159).

m. 159

An instance of word painting was found in Whythorne's four-voiced song, "If I had not foreseen"(Wh mm.12 and 23). In the setting of the word "protest", Whythorne sets a cross-relation twice in a one chordal section(mm.11-24), making it more obvious and therefore more effectively expressive:

The image shows a musical score for the phrase "I do protest" in four voices. The score is written on four staves. The first staff is labeled "m.12". The lyrics "I do protest" are written below each staff. The music is in a one-chordal section, and the cross-relation is clearly visible in the way the notes for "protest" are written across the different voices.

In view of the observations of individual composers and pieces, there is a conclusion in order: the English use of the cross-relation in the sixteenth century was not confined solely to secular music but occurs in motets and liturgical settings. Another point of prime importance is stated well in the Grove's Dictionary discussion of the cross-relation:

"The parts which were falsely related were always, in themselves, melodically coherent. Clashes arose normally, through the simultaneous pursuit of two distinct and conflicting melodic idioms. False relations are thus outstanding examples of the evolution of harmonic values from melodic sources [*italics mine*]"(Dy p.13).

This states well, I feel, the apparent reasoning of Tallis, Byrd, and Whythorne whenever, however, and to what expressive extent their use of the cross-relation was employed. In aiming for melodic coherence, and at times expressive descriptive effect, the sixteenth century English composers used the cross-relation with musical success and national distinction.

"Appendix"

In the following appendix is a list of the works examined and the simultaneous cross-relations found. Of seventy-six works of Tallis, there were fifteen instances of cross-relations occurring in five songs. Byrd used a total of twenty-four cross-relations in twenty works of the 157 examined. Of Whythorne's seventy-six songs, three contained a total of four cross-relations.

In the Bibliography which follows, reference is made to the music listed in the Appendix for the purpose of indicating which collections or editions were used. As each work in the Appendix is numbered, reference to this material will be made in terms of "items".

W The Collected Works of William Byrd. Ed. by E.H. Fellowes.
Rev. by Thurston Dart, 1966.

Vol. I	Cross-relation
1. Aspice Domine, quia facta.	
2. Attolite portas	
3. Da mihi auxilium	
4. Diliges Dominum	
5. Domine, secundum pars I	
6. Ideo deprecor pars II	
7. Emendemus in melius	
8. Gloria Patri	p.267 m.59
9. Laudate pueri	
10. Libera me, Domine pars I	
11. Dies mei transierunt pars II	
12. Libera me, Domine, de morta aeterna	
13. Memento homo	
14. Miserere mihi, Domine	p.241 m.11, m.28.
15. Olux beata pars I	
16. Te mane laudum pars II	p.175 m.26
17. Deo Patri sit gloria pars III	
18. Peccantem me quotidie	
19. Siderum rector	p.204 m.52
20. Te deprecor	
21. Tribue Domine	p.249 m.39
Vol. II <u>Cantiones Sacrae</u> (1589)	
22. Aspice, Domine, de sede pars I	p.144 m.52
23. Respice, Domine pars II	
24. Defecit in dolore pars I	
25. Sed tu, Domine pars II	
26. Deus, venerunt gentes pars I	
27. Posuerunt morticinia pars II	
28. Effunerunt sangiunem pars III	
29. Facti sumus oporobrium pars IV	p.101 m.26
30. Domine, praestolamur pars I	
31. Veni, Domine pars II	
32. Domine, secundum	
33. Domine, tu iurasti	
34. In resurrectione tua	
35. Laetentur coeli pars I	
36. Orietur, pars II	
37. Memento, Domine	p.58 m.34
38. Ne irascaris pars I	
39. Civitas sancti tui pars II	p.162 m.44
40. O Domine, adiuva me	
41. O Quam gloriosum pars I	
42. Benedicto et claritas pars II	
43. Tribulationes civitatum pars I	
44. Timor et hebitudo pars II	
45. Nos enim pro peccatis pars III	

46. Tristitia et anxietas pars I
47. Sed tu, Domine pars II
48. Vide, Domine pars I
49. Sed veni, Domine pars II
50. Vigilate, nescitis enim

Vol. III Cantiones Sacrae (1591)

51. Afflicti pro peccatis pars I
52. Ut eruas nos a malis pars II
53. Apparebit in finim
54. Cantate Domino
55. Circumdederunt me
56. Cunctus diebus
57. Descendit de coelis pars I p.151 m.14; p.155 m.53
58. Et exivit per auream portam pars II
59. Domine exaudi orationem pars I
60. Et non intres in iudicium pars II
61. Domine, non sum dignus
62. Domine, salva nos
63. Exsurge, Domine p.135 m.32
64. Fac cum servo tu
65. Haec dicit Dominum pars I
66. Haec dicit Dominam pars II
67. Haec dies
68. Infelix ego omnium pars I
69. Quid igitur faciam pars II p.180 m.51
70. Ad te igitur pars III p.180 m.47
71. Laudibus in sanctis pars I
72. Magnificum Domini pars II
73. Hunc arguta pars III
74. Levemus corda nostra p.115 m.48
75. Miserere mei Deus
76. Quis est homo pars I
77. Diverte a malo pars II
78. Recordare Domini pars I
79. Quiescat Domine pars II
80. Salve Regina pars I
81. Et Jesum benedictum pars II
82. Tribulatio proxima est pars I
83. Contumelias et terrares pars II

Vol. VI Gradualia (Part 1) (1607)

84. Ab ortu solis
85. Alleluia Cognoverunt discipuli
86. Beata Virgo
87. Dies Sanctificatus
88. Ecce adoenit
89. Ego sum panis vivus
90. Haec dies
91. Hodie Christus natus est

- 92. Iesu nostra redemptio
- 93. O Admirabile commercium
- 94. O magnum misterium
- 95. O quam suavis
- 96. Pascha nostrum
- 97. Puer natus est noliis
- 98. Reges Tharsis
- 99. Resurrexi
- 100. Surgi illuminare
- 101. Terra tremuit
- 102. Tui sunt coeli
- 103. Venite comedite
- 104. Victimae Paschali
- 105. Viderunt omnes fines
- 106. Viderunt omnes fines
- 107. Videmus stellam eius

p.137 m.3

Vol. XIII Songs of Sundrie Natures (1589)

- 108. An earthly tree
- 109. Cast off all doubtful care
- 110. And think, ye nymphs?
- 111. Love is a fit of pleasure
- 112. Attend mine humble prayer
- 113. Behold how good a thing
- 114. And as the pleasant morning
- 115. Christ rising again
- 116. Christ is risen again
- 117. Compel the hawk to sit
- 118. From Citheron
- 119. There careless thoughts
- 120. If love be just
- 121. From depth of sin
- 122. From virgin's womb
- 123. Rejoice, Rejoice
- 124. I thought that Love
- 125. If in thine heart
- 126. Is Love a boy
- 127. Boy, pity me
- 128. Lord, hear my prayer
- 129. Lord, in thy rage
- 130. Lord, in thy wrath
- 131. O dear life
- 132. O God, which art most merciful
- 133. O Lord, my God
- 134. Of gold all burnished
- 135. Her breath is more sweet
- 136. Penelope that longed
- 137. Right blest are they
- 138. See those sweet eyes
- 139. Love would discharge
- 140. Susanna fair

p.230 m.60; p.231 m.69

p.213 m.11; p.216 m.39

p.177 m.100

141. The greedy hawk
142. The nightingale so pleasant
143. Unto the hills mine eyes I lift
144. Upon a summer's day
145. Then for a boat
146. Weeping full sore
147. When first by force
148. When I was otherwise
149. When younglings first
150. But when by proof
151. While that the sun
152. Who made thee Hob? p.242 m.17
153. Wounded I am
154. Yet of us twain

155. Two Sacred Songs in Four Parts By William Byrd.
156. Ed. by Hans T.David. 1944 second song m. 34

157. Audivi Vocem ed. Joseph Kerman ms. copy, mechanically reproduced.

-Tallis-

158. Agnus Dei p.102 mm.64 and 65
159. Salvator Mundi p.106 m.12
160. Derelinquat impius
161. Blessed are those
162. If ye love me, keep my Commandments
163. Lamentations Part I m.5
Part II mm.60, 61, 81, 105, 110, 111, 113, 115, 118
164. In ieunio et fletu p.5 m.48
165. Magnificat
166. Nunc Dimittis p.15 m.34
167. Euge Coeli Porta
168. Heare the voyce and prayer of thy servants
169. In manus tuas
170. Audivi vocem

-Whythorne-

Wh Thomas Whythorne Songs for Three, Four, and Five Parts.
(transcriptions supplied by James Erb.)

171. All ye that serve
172. As many heads
173. As restless head
174. As thy shadow
175. As tis a sign
176. Behold, now praise the Lord m.159
177. Beware how sorrows thee oppress
178. Buy new broom
179. The divers chance
180. The doubtful state
181. For to reclaim
182. The gifts of nature
183. Give not thy mind
184. Grace after meat m.17
185. Grace before meat
186. The great offense
187. The happy life
188. The haughtiness of some
189. He that condemneth
190. I cannot deem thee happy
191. I have ere this time
192. I have not only read
193. I will yield thanks
194. If every one
195. If flattered be
196. If I had not foreseen mm.12 and 23
197. If thou that hast
198. In friends of each estate
199. In weal and woe be patient
200. Is there no choice
201. It doth belong
202. It doth me good
203. It hath been proved
204. It is a world
205. Like as the smoke
206. My soul and all
207. The music tunes
208. Now that the truth is tried
209. Nothing is sharper than low things
210. O be joyful
211. O come let us sing
212. O good Lord, have mercy
213. O lord above
214. Of a hard beginning
215. Of nature's gifts
216. Out of the deep
217. The pleasant and the gentle speech
218. Ponder the proof
219. Prefer not great beauty
220. The restless race

MUSIC LIBRARY
UNIVERSITY OF RICHMOND

221. Shall I this woe sustain
222. Since I embrace
223. Such as in love
224. Take heed of words
225. Till time had taught
226. Thou shalt soon sue
227. Though choler cleapt
228. though crooked cares
229. Though fortune frown
230. Though friends be frail
231. Thy secrets told
232. To overcome by patience
233. To reprehend or mock
234. Whatever hath been
235. When cupid had
236. When fliering fortune
237. When fortune seemed
238. When I remember
239. When that well tippled are
240. When wit doth seek
241. Where praises great
242. Who that for truth
243. Who that to quaffing
244. Who that will weigh
245. Who that to quaffing

-Gesualdo-

- 246. Luci serene e chiare
- 247. Ecco, moriro dunque
- 248. Ohi, gia mi discoloro
- 249. Io tacero
- 250. Invan dunque a crudele
- 251. Dolcissima mia vita
- 252; Itene o mici sospiri
- 253. Moro lasso al mio duolo
- 254. Resta di darmi
- 255. Gia piansi nel dolore
- 256. Io Pur Respiro
- 257. Non T'amo
- 258. O come e gran martire
- 259. Tu M'uccidi, O Crudele
- 260. Moro lasso

-Lasso-

261. Pronuba Juno
262. Praesidium Sara
263. Beati pauperes
264. Beati pacifici
265. Cum rides mihi
266. Data est de lachrymis
267. Quicumque vult salvus
268. Alia est enim persona
269. Et tamen non tres aeterna
270. Haec est fides
271. Zachau, festinans descende
272. Da pacem
273. Bestia curvafia
274. Gloria patri et filio
275. Lauda Sion salvatorem
276. Dies enim sollempnis
277. Quod non capis
278. Ecce panis angelorum
279. Lucescit jam a socii
280. Nunc Dimittis
281. Deus in adjutorium
282. Auroro lucis rutilat
283. Omnis homo premium
284. Recordare, Jesu pie
285. Lamentations of Prophet Jeremiah

-Palestrina-

- 286. Agnus Dei, from Mass "Ecce Sacerdas Magnus"
- 287. Congratulamini Mihi
- 288. Agnus Dei, from Mass "Veni sponsa Christi"
- 289. Sicut cervus desiderat
- 290. Sitivit anima mea
- 291. Benedictus, from Mass "Lauda Sion"
- 292. Adjuro vos
- 293. Alla riva de Tebro

Bibliography

I. Books

- Dy Dyson, Sir George "False Relations"; Grove's Dictionary of Music and Musicians. Fifth edition 1960. Vol. III
- Ke Kerman, Joseph "Byrd, Tallis, and the Art of Imitation" Aspects of Medieval and Renaissance Music. Jan La Rue ed. 1966 W.W. Norton and Co.
- M Morris, R.O. Contrapuntal Technique in Sixteenth Century 1939 Oxford University Press.
- R Reese, Gustave Music in the Renaissance 1954. W.W. Norton and Co.

II. Music

- Byrd:
- W The Collected Works of William Byrd. Ed. by E.H. Fellowes Rev. by Thurston Dart. 1966. Vol. I,II, III, VI, XIII. items 1-154.
- WB Two Sacred Songs in Four Parts by William Byrd. Ed. by Hans T. David. 1944 items 155, 156.
- K "Audiui Vocem" by William Byrd Ed. Joseph Kerman 1964, ms. copy, mechanically reproduced.
- Tallis:
- CA Classic Anthems "Magnificat" and "Nunc Dimittis" Ed. by Ernest White. 1946 items 165 and 166.
- CU Columbia University Choir Series "Blessed are Those" Ed. by Lowel P. Beveridge. 1946 item 161.
- K "Derelinquat impius" ms. ed. Joseph Kerman. 1961 ms. copy mechanically reproduced. item 160.
- G English Song Book, An ed. Noah Greenberg. 1961 Doubleday and Co. items 158 and 159.
- Sc G. Schirmer's Choral Church Music "If ye love me, keep my Commandments" item 162.
- K "In ieiunio et fletu" ed. Joseph Kerman. 1964 ms. copy mechanically reproduced item 160.
- Tr Treasury of Early Music, A ed. Carl Parrish. 1958 W.W. Norton and Co. item 168.

TCM Tudor Church Music ed. P.C. Buck, E.H. Fellowes, A. Ramsbotham, R.R. Terry, and S.T. Warner. 1928 Vol.VI items 167 and 163.

Wh Whythorne:
Whythorne, Thomas Songs of Three, Fower, and Five Voyces. transcriptions supplied by James Erb. items 171-245.

Gesualdo:
Gesualdo, Delli Madrigali a cinque voci, Libro Sesto, No. XXII "Gia Piansi" item 255.

Gesualdo, Samtliche Madrigale. ms. ed. Weismann. Sixth book. "Resta di darmi" item 254.

"Io pur respiro" ms. ed. Kurt Stone. 1966 Alexander Broude Inc. item 256.

Eight Madrigale fur funfstimmigen Chor ms. ed. Wilhelm Weismann. 1931. Peters edition items 246-253.

Three Madrigals by Carlo Gesualdo ms. ed. Don Smithers 1964. G. Schirmer. items 257,258,259.

Lasso:
Dessoff Choir Series "Lamentations" ms. ed. Paul Boepple 1942. item 285.

Orlando di Lasso Samtliche Werke ed. by F.X. Haberl and A. Sandberger. Vol. XV. pp.112-114, 38-40. Vol. XVII pp. 160-162. Vol.XXI pp. 119-125. items 281-284.

Orlando di Lasso, Samtliche Werke. Neue Reihe. Vol. I, 1956. Baerenreiter-Verlag. items 261-280.

Palestrina:
Geschichte Der Musick in Beispielen ed. Arnold Schering 1931. Breitkopf and Haertel. items 291 and 292.

Historical Anthology of Music by Archibald T. Davidson and Willi Apel. Revised edition 1948 items 288 and 293.

Masterpieces of Music Before 1750 ed. Carl Parrish and John F. Ohl 1951. W.W. Norton and Co. item 288.

Pierluiga da Palestrina Werke Vol X "Erstes Buch der Messen," ed. F.X. Haberl 1880 Breitkopf and Haertel item 286.

St. Dunstan Edition of Sacred Music ed. Canon Walter Williams 1959. E.C. Schirmer. items 289 and 290.