

2008

Book Review: Long Before Stonewall: Histories of Same-Sex Sexuality in Early America

John R. Pagan

University of Richmond, jpagan@richmond.edu

Follow this and additional works at: <http://scholarship.richmond.edu/law-faculty-publications>



Part of the [Law and Society Commons](#), and the [Other Law Commons](#)

Recommended Citation

John Ruston Pagan, *Book Review*, 95 *J. Am. Hist.* 179 (2008) (reviewing Thomas Foster, ed., *Long Before Stonewall: Histories of Same-Sex Sexuality in Early America* (2007)).

This Book Review is brought to you for free and open access by the School of Law at UR Scholarship Repository. It has been accepted for inclusion in Law Faculty Publications by an authorized administrator of UR Scholarship Repository. For more information, please contact scholarshiprepository@richmond.edu.

tempted to earn their living on farms in northern Wisconsin's "cutover district."

Part 1 offers an extended reading of the four travelers' accounts. Olmanson compares their responses to shoreline landmarks such as Grand Sable, but his conclusion, that differences among them shows "how subjective the human experience of the environment can be," seems relatively inconsequential (p. 65). Part 2 switches rather abruptly to Chequamegon Bay without any explanation of why it was chosen among all the stretches of territory covered in part 1. After consideration of the early legislative history of the state and some commentary on the politics of surveying, Olmanson observes that from the 1850s through the 1890s, boosters of the region "simultaneously promote a vision of the Chequamegon Bay region as a pristine wilderness, on the one hand, and a future urban industrial center, on the other" (p. 121). Olmanson fails to note that the same could be said of many other developing regions at this time, a point that both John Reys and David Wrobel have made in their studies of frontier urban planning and booster literature, respectively.

Ultimately, the most interesting of the several set pieces that Olmanson provides in this section is his comparison between the structure of Frederick Jackson Turner's frontier thesis argument and the promotion of the Wisconsin Central Railroad in 1877 by his father, Andrew Jackson Turner (pp. 163–66). Throughout, Olmanson alludes to other stories that contributed to the construction of the place, including those of the local Ojibway and of the many foreign-born residents who came to Ashland, but those stories are missing from the narrative he provides in *The Future City on the Inland Sea*.

C. Elizabeth Raymond
University of Nevada
Reno, Nevada

Long before Stonewall: Histories of Same-Sex Sexuality in Early America. Ed. by Thomas A. Foster. (New York: New York University Press, 2007. x, 405 pp. Cloth, \$75.00, ISBN 978-0-8147-2749-2. Paper, \$25.00, ISBN 978-0-8147-2750-8.)

The modern gay rights movement began on

June 27, 1969, when the patrons of the Stonewall Inn, a bar near Sheridan Square in the heart of Greenwich Village, courageously resisted a police raid. "Homo Nest Raided, Queen Bees Are Stinging Mad," screeched a headline in the *New York Daily News*. Anger soon gave way to militant pride. Homosexuals proclaimed their identity, fought for the right to express their sexuality, demanded legal protection for their relationships, and earned the respect of a large segment of straight society.

Gay political solidarity may have originated at Stonewall, but same-sex attraction is as old as history itself. So is homosexual behavior. Like heterosexual conduct, homosexual acts emanate from what Plato (in *Symposium*) called "our pursuit of wholeness": the quest to unite physically with one's other half. If homosexual acts have been around forever, what about homosexual identity? When did practitioners of same-sex intimacy begin to define themselves, at least in part, by the nature of their desires? When did Americans start classifying population groups on the basis of sexual orientation?

Michel Foucault famously maintained that society did not begin to view "the homosexual" as a distinct category of person until the nineteenth century, when medical models of sexuality encouraged people to think in ways that led them to invent the modern notion of sexual identity. This stimulating and important collection of essays suggests, however, that in America the process of homosexual-identity formation commenced much earlier than Foucault claimed. The editor, Thomas A. Foster, argues in the introduction that "long before Stonewall," that is, during the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries, "the history of same-sex sexuality took root and began establishing cultural precedents that later medical models drew upon" (p. 8). He and his collaborators persuasively demonstrate that the acts-versus-identity dichotomy is an oversimplification. Sexual behavior influenced early Americans' sense of self, as well as their standing in the community, and shaped a consciousness that eventually bore the label of sexual identity.

Much of the book's strength stems from the diversity of approaches employed by the essayists. They rely on an impressive array of materials and interpretive techniques, ranging from

Richard Godbeer's brilliantly nuanced use of legal records in "The Cry of Sodom': Discourse, Intercourse, and Desire in Colonial New England," and Lisa L. Moore's insightful literary analysis in "The Swan of Litchfield: Sarah Pierce and the Lesbian Landscape Poem," to Ramon A. Gutiérrez's fascinating anthropological exploration of the Native American berdache tradition in "Warfare, Homosexuality, and Gender Status among American Indian Men in the Southwest." The collection also includes articles by Gunlög Fur, Tracy Brown, Anne G. Myles, Elizabeth Reis, Clare A. Lyons, Lillian Faderman, Caleb Crain, Mark E. Kann, John Saillant, Laura Mandell, and Stephen Shapiro, plus an afterword by John D'Emilio. Five of the essays, amounting to roughly a third of the book, are reprinted from other sources such as the *William and Mary Quarterly*; the rest are original to this volume.

Spanning the colonial, revolutionary, and early national periods, *Long before Stonewall* makes a substantial contribution to our understanding of sexual acts and identities. Almost all of the essays are of exceptionally high quality, reflecting the maturation of sexuality studies in general and gay history in particular.

John Ruston Pagan
University of Richmond
Richmond, Virginia

Stealing Indian Women: Native Slavery in the Illinois Country. By Carl J. Ekberg. (Urbana: University of Illinois Press, 2007. xviii, 236 pp. \$38.00, ISBN 978-0-252-03208-0.)

Few topics in early American history are as difficult to unravel as the trade in native slaves. Carl J. Ekberg's *Stealing Indian Women* follows recent work on the slave trade undertaken by Alan Gallay, Brett Rushforth, and James Brooks. A paucity of sources makes it almost impossible for Ekberg to write definitively about the Illinois slave trade, much less on women's places within it, so he tackles his subject in an unconventional way by dividing his book into two parts. The first focuses on the creation and development of the native slave trade under the French and Spanish regimes, while the second examines the "Céladon affair," a murder that embroiled enslaved

native people, a trader, and highly placed officials in the Spanish government.

In the 1720s a handful of settlers began to cultivate wheat in the Illinois country and imported enslaved Africans and their descendants to work their fields. At the same time, the population of enslaved native people in Illinois grew, but, unlike their counterparts who worked the fields, enslaved native people tended to reside in settlements such as Ste. Genevieve, Kaskaskia, and St. Louis, and were dispersed rather widely among the merchant and trader classes. Women and their children made up the majority of the Illinois native slave population, and they toiled typically as domestic servants. Unfortunately, their ethnic identities are almost impossible to discern owing to silent sources, however, the best guess is that most of them were Pawnees.

Such a sketch provides the backdrop against which Ekberg assesses the Céladon affair, which culminated in the murder of a native woman and the hunt for her alleged assailant. Ekberg's exposition of the affair reveals an eclectic community of enslaved native peoples, traders, and colonial officers, but because he treats the affair separately from the preceding overview of native slavery, the reader is left to braid together two alternate approaches that never quite come together in the end.

A few words need to be said as well about the book's tone. Ekberg writes in the vernacular of "old Indian history," a tradition premised on the inevitable decline and collapse of native peoples in the face of European/Anglo-American invasion. When, for example, the author refers to native peoples as "formerly proud" who, once fallen, became "pathetic," one is reminded of Frederick Jackson Turner or even Francis Parkman (pp. 131–32). Likewise, Ekberg's description of one native woman as "an aristocratic Illinois virgin" harkens back to early colonial tropes instead of drawing on recent developments in the scholarship of native womanhood (p. 38).

Stealing Indian Women rounds out an emerging picture of the native slave trade in colonial America, and Ekberg's portrayal of the colonists' Illinois country is colorful and informed. In the absence of the kind of ethno-historical analysis that is standard today in the field of native history, however, *Stealing Indian*