2012

Civil Procedure: Cases, Materials, and Questions

Wendy Collins Perdue  
*University of Richmond, wperdue@richmond.edu*

Richard D. Freer

Follow this and additional works at: [http://scholarship.richmond.edu/law-faculty-publications](http://scholarship.richmond.edu/law-faculty-publications)  
Part of the [Civil Procedure Commons](http://scholarship.richmond.edu/law-faculty-publications)

Recommended Citation  
Richard D. Freer & Wendy Collins Perdue, Civil Procedure: Cases, Materials, and Questions (Sixth ed., 2012)

This Book is brought to you for free and open access by the School of Law at UR Scholarship Repository. It has been accepted for inclusion in Law Faculty Publications by an authorized administrator of UR Scholarship Repository. For more information, please contact scholarshiprepository@richmond.edu.
CIVIL PROCEDURE
CASES, MATERIALS, AND
QUESTIONS

SIXTH EDITION

RICHARD D. FREER
Robert Howell Hall Professor of Law
Emory University School of Law

WENDY COLLINS PERDUE
Dean and Professor of Law
University of Richmond School of Law

® LexisNexis®
PREFACE

Civil Procedure is a challenging course both for students and teachers. Of all the first year subjects, it is the most alien to students' pre-law school lives. As a result, the course sometimes seems to students to be unconnected to the "real world." Ironically, of all the first year courses, Civil Procedure is the most connected to the "real world" of what lawyers do. Graduates routinely report that Civil Procedure is central to their work.

Thus one challenge for professors (and casebook authors) is to bridge the gap in student experience. The book addresses this issue by including many problems and hypotheticals which are intended to make the material more concrete. We also include notes and questions that explore the strategic and ethical choices that real lawyers face.

A second challenge is that the course includes significant amounts of detail, but at the same time raises such fundamental questions as the role of justice, fairness and efficiency in the adjudication of rights. Students sometimes miss the richness of the course because they fail to see how its various aspects fit together — they may come away with a knowledge of individual trees but not an overall sense of the forest. This book seeks to avoid that result by stressing integration. The chapters are arranged in related blocks and each chapter begins with a section called "Introduction and Integration" which provides an overview and indicates how the section fits with other topics.

In some areas, we have arranged material differently from what seems to be the common approach. We do this to facilitate the integrative function. The first part of the book addresses where litigation can proceed and includes personal jurisdiction, subject matter jurisdiction, and venue. We have also included notice and service of process in this part because of its close relationship to personal jurisdiction.

Next, the book moves to the phases of a law suit — pleading, discovery, and adjudication (with and without a jury). Joinder is covered later because we do not believe this topic is necessary to understanding the basic steps of litigation and, by delaying it, we can cover it with the related issues of preclusion. Covering pleading and discovery back-to-back highlights that they are both methods of information exchange. The chapter on adjudication includes both summary judgment and judgment as a matter of law. In this edition, we have moved the *Erie* chapter after the chapter on adjudication. The reason is that students have a better chance of understanding *Gasperini* if they have already studied Rule 59.

Next are three chapters on preclusion and joinder. We view them as a unit on "packaging" of litigation. We begin with preclusion. That chapter, which explores the goals of efficiency and finality, lays the foundation for the joinder chapters. Although we introduce supplemental jurisdiction briefly in the chapter on subject matter jurisdiction, we defer detailed analysis until the joinder chapters. This seems particularly necessary after the passage of § 1367 which students cannot understand without first studying the joinder rules. Following joinder, we address appeals.

This course stresses civil procedure as part of the litigation process — a publicly funded system of dispute resolution. We feel that students should consider whether the litigation system is a good way to resolve disputes. The last chapter of the book raises questions about alternative dispute resolution and comparative law. We feel that these
PREFACE

issues are well treated at the end of the course, after the students have seen the litigation process fully.

Recent years have seen remarkable change in civil procedure. Much of this has been generated by the Supreme Court. Indeed, seven major cases — decided since the publication of our fifth edition in 2008 — are featured in this edition. Two of these cases — J. McIntyre Machinery Ltd. v. Nicastro, 131 S. Ct. 2780 (2011), and Goodyear Dunlop Tires Operations, S.A. v. Brown, 131 S. Ct. 2846 (2011) — represent the Court’s first efforts in personal jurisdiction since 1990. Each is a principal opinion in Chapter 2, with notes and questions probing their potential impact. The third case is The Hertz Corporation v. Friend, 130 S. Ct. 1181 (2010), which brings considerable clarity to the definition of a corporation’s principal place of business for purposes of diversity of citizenship jurisdiction. The fourth case is part of the Court’s revolution in pleading — started with Bell Atlantic Corp. v. Twombly, 550 U.S. 544 (2007), which was included in the fifth edition. It is, of course, Ashcroft v. Iqbal, 129 S. Ct. 1937 (2009). In this edition, we follow these two cases with an instructive Seventh Circuit case in which Judges Wood and Posner disagree on the application of the “plausibility” requirement. The Court’s fifth major case is Shady Grove Orthopedic Assoc. v. Allstate Ins. Co., 130 S. Ct. 1431 (2010), which is now a principal vehicle for considering the application of the Federal Rules and validity under the Rules Enabling Act. Sixth, in Taylor v. Sturgell, 553 U.S. 880 (2008), the Court rejected virtual representation and clarified when a non-party might be bound by a judgment. Finally, in Chapter 13, Wal-Mart Stores, Inc. v. Dukes, 131 S. Ct. 2541 (2011), limits the scope of Rule 23(b)(2) classes and may portend a limiting interpretation of the commonality requirement under Rule 23(a)(2).

The Rules Advisory Committee has continued its activity. Of especial interest is the 2010 amendment to summary judgment practice under Rule 56, which we address in Chapter 9.

Finally, Congress has weighed in with broad changes to removal jurisdiction and venue in the Jurisdiction and Venue Clarification Act of 2011, which became effective in January 2012. We are pleased that this edition includes treatment of these new provisions.

Notes on Form

We indicate textual deletions from opinions and other materials by “* * *.” We have not noted deletions of citations from opinions. Our additions to cases are enclosed in brackets. Our footnotes are denoted by asterisks. We have retained the original numbering of footnotes appearing in opinions. We have adopted a short form of citing the several classic treatises to which we refer throughout the book. With apologies to the contributing authors on the two standard multi-volume treatises, we refer to them, respectively, as MOORE’S FEDERAL PRACTICE AND WRIGHT & MILLER, FEDERAL PRACTICE AND PROCEDURE. CHARLES ALAN WRIGHT & MARY KAY KANE, LAW OF FEDERAL COURTS (7th ed. 2011) is cited WRIGHT & KANE, FEDERAL COURTS; MARTIN REDISH, FEDERAL JURISDICTION: TENSIONS IN THE ALLOCATION OF JUDICIAL POWER (2d ed. 1990) is cited REDISH, FEDERAL JURISDICTION; JACK FRIEDENTHAL, MARY KAY KANE & ARTHUR MILLER, CIVIL PROCEDURE (4th ed. 2005); LARRY TEPLY & RALPH WHITSEN, CIVIL PROCEDURE (4th ed. 2009) is cited TEPLY & WHITSEN, CIVIL PROCEDURE, and RICHARD D. FREER, CIVIL PROCEDURE (2d ed. 2009) is cited FREER, CIVIL PROCEDURE.
# Table of Contents

## Chapter 1  AN INTRODUCTION TO THE CIVIL ACTION AND PROCEDURE  ......................................... 1

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A.</td>
<td>THE STUDY OF PROCEDURE</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B.</td>
<td>FEDERALISM</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C.</td>
<td>OVERVIEW OF THE STRUCTURE OF A COURT SYSTEM</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>Trial Courts</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>Intermediate Appellate Courts</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
<td>Supreme Courts</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.</td>
<td>Appellate Practice and the Doctrine of Precedent</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D.</td>
<td>THE ADVERSARY SYSTEM</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E.</td>
<td>ALTERNATIVES TO LITIGATION</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F.</td>
<td>A BRIEF HISTORY OF OUR ENGLISH JUDICIAL ROOTS</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>G.</td>
<td>GENERAL TOPICS OF CIVIL PROCEDURE</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>Selecting the Forum (Chapters 2-6, 10)</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>Learning About the Opponent's Case (Chapters 7 &amp; 8)</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
<td>Adjudication With or Without a Jury (Chapter 9)</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.</td>
<td>Preclusion, Joinder, and Supplemental Jurisdiction (Chapters 11-13)</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.</td>
<td>Appeal (Chapter 14)</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.</td>
<td>Litigation Alternatives (Chapter 15)</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.</td>
<td>A Quick Note on Materials</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## Chapter 2  PERSONAL JURISDICTION  ................. 21

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A.</td>
<td>INTRODUCTION AND INTEGRATION</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B.</td>
<td>CONSTITUTIONAL LIMITS ON PERSONAL JURISDICTION</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>The Fountainhead — <em>Pennoyer v. Neff</em></td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>Interim Developments</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
<td>The Modern Era</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.</td>
<td><em>International Shoe Co. v. Washington</em></td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.</td>
<td>Notes and Questions</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.</td>
<td>Note on <em>McGee, Hanson, and Gray</em></td>
<td>36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.</td>
<td>World-Wide Volkswagen v. Woodson</td>
<td>41</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.</td>
<td>Notes and Questions</td>
<td>44</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.</td>
<td>Note on <em>Keeton and Calder</em></td>
<td>46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.</td>
<td>Personal Jurisdiction in Federal Court</td>
<td>56</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.</td>
<td>Note on <em>Keeton and Calder</em></td>
<td>59</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12.</td>
<td>Note on <em>Keeton and Calder</em></td>
<td>61</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
# Table of Contents

- Why Litigants Care About Where Litigation Occurs ........................................... 62
- *Burger King Corp. v. Rudzewicz* ................................................................. 63
- Notes and Questions ................................................................. 76
- *J. McIntyre Machinery, Ltd. v. Nicastro* .................................................. 77
- Notes and Questions ................................................................. 92
- 4. General Jurisdiction ............................................................................. 95
- *Goodyear Dunlop Tires Operations, S.A. v. Brown* .................................. 95
- Notes and Questions ................................................................. 100
- 5. Explicit Consent and Forum Selection Provisions .................................. 105
- 6. In Rem and Quasi-in-Rem Jurisdiction ................................................ 106
- *Shaffer v. Heitner* .............................................................................. 106
- Notes and Questions ................................................................. 118
- 7. Transient Presence ............................................................................. 121
- Jurisdiction Over Corporations and Partnerships ..................................... 125
- 8. Personal Jurisdiction and the Internet ................................................ 127
- *Revell v. Lidov* .................................................................................. 128
- Notes and Questions ................................................................. 133
- C. A DIFFERENT PERSPECTIVE ............................................................ 135
- 1. The Purposes of Personal Jurisdiction ............................................. 135
- 2. Personal Jurisdiction in Other Countries .......................................... 137
- Chapter II, Jurisdiction, European Union ............................................. 138
- D. STATUTORY LIMITS ON PERSONAL JURISDICTION ......................... 139
- Official Code of Georgia, Annotated ..................................................... 140
- Notes and Questions ................................................................. 140

## Chapter 3
### NOTICE AND OPPORTUNITY TO BE HEARD .......................... 143

#### A. INTRODUCTION AND INTEGRATION .......................................... 143

#### B. NOTICE .................................................................................. 143

1. The Constitutional Requirement ......................................................... 143
   *Mullane v. Central Hanover Bank & Trust Co.* .................................. 143
   Notes and Questions ................................................................. 150

2. Statutory Requirements .................................................................. 153
   *National Dev. Co. v. Triad Holding Corp.* .................................. 154
   Notes and Questions ................................................................. 157

3. Immunity, Evasion, and “Sewer Service” ........................................ 161

#### C. OPPORTUNITY TO BE HEARD .................................................. 162

   *Connecticut v. Doehr* ................................................................. 163
   Notes and Questions ................................................................. 173

## Chapter 4
### SUBJECT MATTER JURISDICTION ............................................. 177

#### A. INTRODUCTION AND INTEGRATION .......................................... 177
# Table of Contents

| B. | STATE COURTS AND GENERAL SUBJECT MATTER JURISDICTION | 177 |
| C. | FEDERAL COURTS AND LIMITED SUBJECT MATTER JURISDICTION | 178 |
| 1. | The Constitutional Grants and Role of Congress | 178 |
| | Notes and Questions | 178 |
| 2. | Plaintiff’s Burden to Establish Federal Subject Matter Jurisdiction | 179 |
| 3. | Diversity of Citizenship and Alienage Jurisdiction | 180 |
| a. | Introductory Note | 180 |
| b. | The Complete Diversity Rule | 182 |
| | *Strawbridge v. Curtiss* | 182 |
| | Notes and Questions | 183 |
| c. | Determining Citizenship of Individuals | 184 |
| | *Mas v. Perry* | 184 |
| | Notes and Questions | 187 |
| d. | Determining Citizenship of Entities | 191 |
| i. | Corporations | 191 |
| | *Randazzo v. Eagle-Picher Industries, Inc.* | 191 |
| | Notes and Questions | 193 |
| | *Hertz Corporation v. Friend* | 195 |
| | Notes and Questions | 203 |
| ii. | Non-Incorporated Businesses | 204 |
| | *Belleville Catering Co. v. Champaign Market Place L.L.C.* | 205 |
| | Notes and Questions | 207 |
| e. | Representative Suits and Assignments of Claims | 208 |
| f. | The Domestic Relations and Probate Exceptions | 209 |
| g. | The Amount in Controversy Requirement | 211 |
| | Notes and Questions | 211 |
| 4. | Federal Question Jurisdiction | 214 |
| a. | Introductory Note | 214 |
| b. | Narrow Interpretations of the Jurisdictional Statute | 215 |
| i. | The Well-Pleased Complaint Rule | 215 |
| | *Louisville & Nashville Railroad Co. v. Mottley* | 215 |
| | Notes and Questions | 217 |
| ii. | Well-Pleased Complaint Problems Raised by Declaratory Judgments | 220 |
| iii. | Centrality of the Federal Issue to the Claim | 222 |
| | *Grable & Sons Metal Products, Inc. v. Darue Engineering & Manufacturing* | 224 |
| | Notes and Questions | 230 |
| 5. | Supplemental Jurisdiction | 233 |
| 6. | Removal Jurisdiction | 233 |
## Table of Contents

Notes and Questions .................................. 234

### Chapter 5  VENUE ...................................... 241

A. INTRODUCTION AND INTEGRATION ......................... 241
B. LOCAL AND TRANSITORY ACTIONS .......................... 241
C. STATE VENUE PROVISIONS .................................. 242
   Maryland Code Annotated ................................ 242
   Notes and Questions .................................. 244
D. VENUE IN FEDERAL COURT ..................................... 245
   The Basic Rules .................................. 245
   Notes and Questions .................................. 246
   Bates v. C & S Adjusters, Inc. .......................... 248
   Notes and Questions .................................. 250
E. CHANGE OF VENUE ........................................ 252
   1. Transfer of Civil Cases in State Courts ............... 252
   2. Transfer of Civil Actions in Federal Court .......... 252
      a. Where Can Cases Be Transferred? ................... 253
      b. Goldlawr Transfers ................................ 254
      c. Forum Selection Clauses ............................ 254
      d. Choice of Law .................................. 254
      e. Standard for Transfer Under §§ 1404 and 1406 ......... 256
      f. Multidistrict Litigation ............................ 257
F. FORUM NON CONVENIENS .................................... 258
   Piper Aircraft Co. v. Reyno ................................ 258
   Notes and Questions .................................. 268

### Chapter 6  RAISING JURISDICTIONAL AND RELATED
              CHALLENGES ........................................ 273

A. INTRODUCTION AND INTEGRATION .......................... 273
B. THE TRADITIONAL AND MODERN APPROACHES TO CHALLENGING
   PERSONAL JURISDICTION ..................................... 273
   Notes and Questions .................................. 275
C. COLLATERAL AND DIRECT ATTACKS ON PERSONAL
   JURISDICTION .............................................. 276
   Baldwin v. Iowa State Traveling Men’s Association ....... 278
   Notes and Questions .................................. 279
D. CHALLENGING FEDERAL SUBJECT MATTER JURISDICTION .... 280

xii
Table of Contents

Chapter 7  PLEADINGS AND JUDGMENTS BASED ON PLEADINGS .......................... 283

A. INTRODUCTION AND INTEGRATION ............................................................ 283

B. HISTORICAL OVERVIEW OF THE EVOLUTION OF PLEADINGS ................. 284

C. THE COMPLAINT ............................................................................................. 286
   1. Requirements .............................................................................................. 287
      a. Elements of the Complaint ..................................................................... 287
         i. A "short and plain statement of the grounds for the court’s jurisdiction” .............................................................. 287
         ii. A "short and plain statement of the claim showing that the pleader is entitled to relief” ............................................. 287
         iii. A “demand for the relief sought, which may include relief in the alternative or different types of relief” ..................... 288
      b. Form of Pleadings .................................................................................... 288
      c. Legal Sufficiency ...................................................................................... 289
         Notes and Questions ................................................................................ 291
      d. Factual (or “Formal”) Sufficiency: The Debate Over Specificity .......... 292
         i. Code Pleading ...................................................................................... 293
         ii. Federal Rules Pleading ........................................................................ 294
            Dioguardi v. Durning ........................................................................... 294
            Notes and Questions ............................................................................ 296
            Bell Atlantic Corporation v. Twombly ...................................................... 297
            Notes and Questions ............................................................................ 305
            The Iqbal Case ..................................................................................... 307
            Notes and Questions ............................................................................ 310
            Swanson v. Citibank, N.A. ................................................................... 311
            Notes and Questions ............................................................................ 317
         iii. The Common Counts ........................................................................... 318
      e. Heightened Specificity Requirements in Certain Cases ......................... 318
         Leatherman v. Tarrant County .................................................................. 319
         Notes and Questions ............................................................................ 321
      f. Pleading Inconsistent Facts and Alternative Theories ............................. 324

2. Voluntary Dismissal ...................................................................................... 325
   Notes and Questions .................................................................................... 326

3. Involuntary Dismissal ................................................................................... 327
   Notes and Questions .................................................................................... 328

D. DEFENDANT’S OPTIONS IN RESPONSE .................................................. 328
   1. Motions ....................................................................................................... 328
      Questions ..................................................................................................... 329
   2. The Answer ................................................................................................ 330
      a. Responses to the Plaintiff’s Allegations .................................................. 330
Table of Contents

i. Admissions .................................................. 330
ii. Denials ...................................................... 330
iii. Denials for Lack of Knowledge or Information ................. 331
b. Affirmative Defenses ......................................... 332
   Notes and Questions ........................................ 333
3. Claims by the Defendant ..................................... 334
4. Failure to Respond: Default and Default Judgment ............... 334
   Notes and Questions ........................................ 335
E. AMENDED PLEADINGS ......................................... 337
1. Basic Principles Under Rule 15(a) ............................ 337
   Notes and Questions ........................................ 337
2. The Problem of Variance Under Rule 15(b) ....................... 339
   Notes and Questions ........................................ 340
3. Amendment and the Statute of Limitations Under Rule 15(c) .... 341
   a. Amendment to Claims or Defenses .......................... 341
      Marsh v. Coleman Company .................................. 341
      Notes and Questions ....................................... 345
   b. Amendment Changing a Party ................................ 345
F. SUPPLEMENTAL PLEADINGS .................................. 346
G. VERACITY IN PLEADING: RULE 11 AND OTHER DEVICES ......... 346
   1. Rule 11 ..................................................... 346
      Model Rules of Professional Conduct ....................... 348
      Notes and Questions ....................................... 350
      Rector v. Approved Federal Savings Bank .................... 351
      Notes and Questions ....................................... 356
   2. Other Sanctions ............................................. 358
Chapter 8 DISCOVERY ............................................ 361
A. INTRODUCTION AND INTEGRATION ............................ 361
B. OVERVIEW OF THE DISCOVERY DEVICES ....................... 364
   1. Required Initial Disclosures (Rule 26(a)(1)) ................ 364
      Questions .................................................. 364
   2. Depositions (Rules 30, 31) ................................ 365
      Questions .................................................. 365
   3. Interrogatories (Rule 33) ................................... 366
      Questions .................................................. 366
   4. Production of Documents and Things (Rule 34) ................. 367
      Questions .................................................. 367
   5. Medical Examination (Rule 35) .............................. 367
      Questions .................................................. 368
   6. Requests for Admission (Rule 36) ............................ 368
### Table of Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>C.</td>
<td>SCOPE OF DISCOVERY</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>General Scope</td>
<td>369</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>United Oil Co. v. Parts Associates, Inc.</td>
<td>369</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Notes and Questions</td>
<td>374</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>Discovery of Material in Electronic Form</td>
<td>376</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Zubulake v. UBS Warburg LLC</td>
<td>376</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Notes and Questions</td>
<td>386</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
<td>Relation to the Rules of Evidence</td>
<td>388</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.</td>
<td>Privileged Material</td>
<td>388</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.</td>
<td>Work Product</td>
<td>391</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Hickman v. Taylor</td>
<td>391</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Notes and Questions</td>
<td>400</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.</td>
<td>Experts</td>
<td>404</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Ager v. Jane C. Stormont Hospital &amp; Training School For Nurses</td>
<td>405</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Notes and Questions</td>
<td>411</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.</td>
<td>Discovery in an International Context</td>
<td>413</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.</td>
<td>Review Problem</td>
<td>415</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D.</td>
<td>TIMING AND PRETRIAL DISCLOSURES, CONFERENCES, AND ORDERS</td>
<td>416</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>Timing</td>
<td>416</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>Pretrial Disclosures</td>
<td>417</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
<td>Pretrial Conferences and Orders</td>
<td>417</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E.</td>
<td>SANCTIONS</td>
<td>421</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Washington State Physicians Insurance Exchange &amp; Association v. Fisons Corp.</td>
<td>421</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Notes and Questions</td>
<td>434</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Chapter 9

#### ADJUDICATION WITH AND WITHOUT A TRIAL OR A JURY

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A.</td>
<td>INTRODUCTION AND INTEGRATION</td>
<td>439</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B.</td>
<td>THE RIGHT TO A JURY</td>
<td>439</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>Scope of the Constitutional Right</td>
<td>439</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a.</td>
<td>&quot;Actions at Common Law&quot; and the Historical Test</td>
<td>441</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Chauffeurs Local 391 v. Terry</td>
<td>441</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Notes and Questions</td>
<td>451</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b.</td>
<td>The Complications of Merger and the Federal Rules</td>
<td>457</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c.</td>
<td>Juries in Non-Article III Courts</td>
<td>458</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d.</td>
<td>Juries in State Courts</td>
<td>459</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>Selection and Size of the Jury</td>
<td>460</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table of Contents

a. The Venire and Voir Dire ........................................ 460
b. Peremptory Challenges ........................................... 460
   J.E.B. v. Alabama ........................................... 461
   Notes and Questions ........................................... 478
c. Two Views of Voir Dire and Peremptory Strikes ............ 480
   The Mapplethorpe Obscenity Trial .......................... 481
   10 Trial Mistakes .............................................. 485
d. Jury Size .......................................................... 485
3. SUMMARY JUDGMENT — ADJUDICATION WITHOUT TRIAL OR JURY ........................................ 487
   Anderson v. Liberty Lobby, Inc. ............................... 489
   Notes and Questions .............................................. 498
   Coble v. City Of White House .................................... 501
   Notes and Questions .............................................. 506
D. CONTROLLING AND SECOND-GUESSING JURIES .................. 508
1. Judgment as a Matter of Law (Directed Verdict and JNOV) .... 508
   Lavender v. Kurn ................................................. 510
   Notes and Questions .............................................. 514
2. New Trials .......................................................... 518
   Dadurian v. Underwriters At Lloyd’s Of London ............ 518
   Notes and Questions .............................................. 524
3. Other Techniques for Controlling Juries ...................... 527
   a. Admissibility of Evidence ................................... 527
   b. Jury Instructions .............................................. 528
   c. Form of the Verdict ........................................... 529
   d. Judicial Comment ............................................. 530
   e. Juror Misconduct .............................................. 531

Chapter 10 WHAT LAW APPLIES IN FEDERAL COURT .......... 535

A. INTRODUCTION AND INTEGRATION .............................. 535
B. DETERMINING WHAT LAW APPLIES ........................... 537
1. The Erie Doctrine ............................................... 537
   Erie Railroad Co. v. Tompkins ................................ 537
   Notes and Questions .............................................. 542
   Note: Constitutional Bases of Erie .......................... 546
2. Early Efforts to Describe When State Law Applies .......... 548
   Byrd v. Blue Ridge Rural Electrical Cooperative, Inc. .... 550
   Notes and Questions .............................................. 553
3. The Federal Rules of Civil Procedure ......................... 555
   Hanna v. Plumer .................................................. 555

xvi
Table of Contents

Note on Understanding Hanna .................................................. 564

a. What Happens When There Is a Federal Rule of Civil Procedure
   on Point — The Rules Enabling Act Prong .............................. 564
   i. Determining Whether a Federal Directive Is on Point .......... 565
b. What Happens When There Is No Federal Rule of Civil Procedure on
   Point — The Rules of Decision Act Prong ............................. 568
   Notes and Questions ..................................................... 568
c. Applying the Hanna Structure ............................................ 570

Gasperini v. Center For Humanities, Inc. .................................... 570
Notes and Questions ......................................................... 581
Shady Grove Orthopedic Association v. Allstate Insurance Co. ........ 583
Notes and Questions ......................................................... 604

C. DETERMINING THE CONTENT OF STATE LAW ......................... 605
   Deweerth v. Baldinger ..................................................... 606
   Notes and Questions ..................................................... 609

D. FEDERAL COMMON LAW ..................................................... 610

E. FEDERAL LAW IN STATE COURT ............................................ 611

Chapter 11 THE PRECLUSION DOCTRINES ................................. 613

A. INTRODUCTION AND INTEGRATION ....................................... 613

B. CLAIM PRECLUSION ............................................................. 615
   1. Scope of a Claim .......................................................... 615
      a. In General ............................................................. 615
      
      Carter v. Hinkle ....................................................... 615
      Notes and Questions ................................................... 618
      b. Contract Cases ....................................................... 622
   2. Parties or Persons in Privity ............................................. 623
      a. Who Can Be Bound? .................................................. 623
      Notes and Questions ................................................... 624
      b. Configuration of the Parties ..................................... 625
      Notes and Questions ................................................... 626
   3. Valid, Final Judgment, on the Merits .................................. 626
      a. Validity ............................................................... 626
      b. Finality ............................................................... 626
      c. On the Merits ........................................................ 627
      Notes and Questions ................................................... 628
   4. Exceptions to the Operation of Claim Preclusion .................. 629
      Notes and Questions ................................................... 630

C. ISSUE PRECLUSION .......................................................... 632
   1. Same Issue Litigated and Determined ............................... 632
Table of Contents

Cromwell v. County Of Sac ........................................ 633
Notes and Questions ........................................... 636
2. Issue Determined Was Essential to the Judgment .............. 638
Rios v. Davis ...................................................... 638
Notes and Questions ........................................... 640
3. Against Whom Can Issue Preclusion Be Asserted? .............. 642
Hardy v. Johns-Manville Sales Corp. ............................... 642
Notes and Questions ........................................... 645
a. Mutuality and Exceptions ................................... 649
b. Rejection of Mutuality for Defensive Use ...................... 651
   Notes and Questions ...................................... 652
c. Rejection of Mutuality for Offensive Use ...................... 654
   Parklane Hosiery Co. v. Shore ................................ 654
   Notes and Questions ...................................... 657
5. Exceptions to the Operation of Issue Preclusion ............... 660
   Notes and Questions ...................................... 660
D. PROBLEMS OF FEDERALISM .................................... 662
1. State-to-State ................................................ 662
2. State-to-Federal ............................................. 663
3. Federal-to-State ............................................. 664
4. Federal-to-Federal ............................................ 665

Chapter 12 SCOPE OF LITIGATION — JOINDER AND
SUPPLEMENTAL JURISDICTION .................................. 667

A. INTRODUCTION AND INTEGRATION .............................. 667
B. REAL PARTY IN INTEREST, CAPACITY, AND STANDING ........ 668
   Notes and Questions ...................................... 670
C. CLAIM JOINDER BY PLAINTIFFS ............................... 671
   1. Procedural Aspects ...................................... 671
   2. Jurisdictional Aspects ................................... 672
      United Mine Workers v. Gibbs ............................ 672
      Notes and Questions ................................... 676
D. PERMISSIVE PARTY JOINDER BY PLAINTIFFS .................. 679
   1. Procedural Aspects ...................................... 679
      Schwartz v. Swan ........................................ 680
      Notes and Questions ................................... 684
   2. Jurisdictional Aspects ................................... 688
      Notes and Questions ................................... 689
E. CLAIM JOINDER BY DEFENDANTS ............................... 692
   1. Counterclaims ........................................... 692

xviii
Table of Contents

1. Compulsory Counterclaims .................................................. 692
   a. Procedural Aspects .................................................... 692
      *Dindo v. Whitney* .................................................. 692
      *Carteret Savings & Loan Assn. v. Jackson* ..................... 694
      Notes and Questions ................................................ 695
   ii. Jurisdictional Aspects ............................................ 698
      Notes and Questions ................................................ 699
   b. Permissive Counterclaims ............................................ 700
   i. Procedural Aspects .................................................. 700
      Notes and Questions ................................................ 700
   ii. Jurisdictional Aspects ............................................ 700
2. Crossclaims ................................................................. 701
   a. Procedural Aspects .................................................. 701
      Notes and Questions ................................................ 701
   b. Jurisdictional Aspects ............................................ 703
      Notes and Questions ................................................ 703
F. OVERRIDING PLAINTIFF’S PARTY STRUCTURE ............................. 704
1. Impleader (Third-Party Practice) ....................................... 705
   a. Procedural Aspects .................................................. 705
      *Markvicka v. Brodhead-Garrett Co.* ............................. 706
      Notes and Questions ................................................ 708
   b. Jurisdictional Aspects ............................................ 709
      *Owen Equipment & Erection Co. v. Kroger* ...................... 710
      Notes and Questions ................................................ 717
2. Compulsory Joinder (Necessary and Indispensable Parties) .......... 719
   a. Procedural Aspects .................................................. 719
      *Haas v. Jefferson National Bank* .................................. 719
      *Temple v. Synthes Corp.* ......................................... 723
      Notes and Questions ................................................ 724
   b. Jurisdictional Aspects ............................................ 727
      Notes and Questions ................................................ 728
3. Intervention ............................................................... 730
   a. Procedural Aspects .................................................. 730
      Notes and Questions ................................................ 731
   b. Jurisdictional Aspects ............................................ 733
      Notes and Questions ................................................ 734

Chapter 13  SPECIAL MULTIPARTY LITIGATION: INTERPLEADER AND THE CLASS ACTION ............................................. 737

A. INTRODUCTION AND INTEGRATION ..................................... 737
B. INTERPLEADER ............................................................ 737
Table of Contents

1. Background .......................................................... 737
2. The Two Types of Interpleader in Federal Court ............... 739
   *Pan American Fire & Casualty Co. v. Revere* .................. 739
   Notes and Questions ............................................. 743
3. The Limits of Interpleader to Avoid Duplicative Litigation ... 747
   *State Farm Fire & Casualty Co. v. Tashire* .................. 747
   Notes and Questions ............................................. 751
C. THE CLASS ACTION .................................................. 753
1. Background .......................................................... 753
2. Policy and Ethical Issues ......................................... 753
3. Constitutional Considerations ................................... 756
   *Hansberry v. Lee* .............................................. 757
   Notes and Questions ............................................. 760
4. Practice Under Federal Rule 23 .................................. 763
   a. Background ..................................................... 763
   b. Filing and Certification of a Class Action ................. 763
   c. Requirements for Certification Under Rule 23 ............ 764
      i. Prerequisites of Rule 23(a) ............................... 765
         Notes and Questions ....................................... 767
      ii. Types of Class Actions Under Rule 23(b) .............. 768
         Notes and Questions ....................................... 771
   d. Notice to Class Members of the Pendency of the Action ... 773
      Notes and Questions ............................................. 774
   e. Court’s Role in Dismissal and Settlement .................. 775
5. Subject Matter Jurisdiction ....................................... 777
   *Exxon Mobil Corp. v. Allapattah Services* ................. 778
   Notes and Questions ............................................. 788
   Note on Jurisdiction Under CAFA ............................... 789
6. Personal Jurisdiction .............................................. 789
   Notes and Questions ............................................. 791

Chapter 14 APPEALS ..................................................... 793
A. INTRODUCTION AND INTEGRATION .................................. 793
B. APPELLATE JURISDICTION IN THE FEDERAL COURTS ............ 794
1. Section 1291 ....................................................... 794
2. Collateral Order Doctrine ....................................... 796
   *Cunningham v. Hamilton County* ................................ 797
   Notes and Questions ............................................. 802
3. Section 1292 ....................................................... 806
   Notes and Questions ............................................. 807
4. Rule 23(f) .......................................................... 809
# Table of Contents

5. Rule 54(b) .................................................. 810
   Notes and Questions .................................. 810
6. Mandamus .................................................. 811
7. Appealability of Discovery Orders ................. 813
8. Mechanics and Timing of Filing an Appeal ....... 814
9. Appellate Jurisdiction of the United States Supreme Court .................. 814
C. APPEALS IN STATE COURTS .......................... 815
D. SCOPE OF REVIEW ...................................... 815
   Notes and Questions .................................. 818
E. REVIEW OF JUDGMENTS OUTSIDE OF THE APPEAL PROCESS ........... 820

Chapter 15 ALTERNATIVE MODELS OF DISPUTE RESOLUTION ................ 823

A. INTRODUCTION AND INTEGRATION ..................... 823
B. MODELS OF GREATER JUDICIAL CONTROL ............ 823
   The German Advantage in Civil Procedure .......... 823
   Notes and Questions .................................. 834
   Sempier v. Johnson & Higgins ......................... 834
   Notes and Questions .................................. 840
C. MODELS OF NON-JUDICIAL RESOLUTION .............. 842
   1. Non-Judicial Adjudication: Arbitration .......... 842
   2. Dispute Resolution Without Adjudication ....... 843
      The Implications of Apology: Law and Culture in Japan and in the United States .................. 844
      Notes and Questions ................................ 849